

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES

DATE: JANUARY 8, 2015

The City of Cincinnati's Civil Service Commission met in regular session in Room 307, City Hall on Thursday, January 8, 2015. Commissioners in attendance were Mr. James Robinson, Chair, Mr. Robert Braddock, and Mr. C. Freeman McNeal. Commission staff present included Ms. Nancy Olind, Assistant HR Director, Ms. Seeta Martindale, Recording Secretary, Darrell Ludlow, Senior Human Resources Analyst, Alexandra White, Senior Human Resources Analyst, Natalie Geiss, Human Resources Analyst, Bruce Ross, Human Resources Analyst, Nosakhare Ekahator, Human Resources Analyst, and Erica Burks, Human Resources Analyst.

AGENDA ITEMS

APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE 12/18/2014 MEETING. Minutes were previously routed and reviewed. Commissioner McNeal made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Braddock seconded the motion, and the minutes were unanimously approved.

APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE:

Cheryl Lackey to the position of Clerk Typist 1 in the Parks Department. This position was posted as an Open-Competitive exam. The staff provided evidence to support the rules for appointment as the candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, successfully passed the Clerk Typist 1 exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

Kurt Lintelman to the position of Senior Computer Programmer in the Enterprise Technology Department. This position was posted as an Open-Competitive exam. The staff provided evidence to support the rules for appointment of this item as the candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

Lindsey Anderson to the position of Casework Associate in the Health Department. This position was posted as an Open-Competitive (Training and Experience) exam. The staff provided evidence to support the rules for appointment of this item as the candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, obtained a passing grade on the exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

Phyllis Richardson to the position of Health Clinic Coordinator in the Health Department. This position was posted as an Open-Competitive (Training and Experience) exam. The staff provided evidence to support the rules for appointment of this item as the candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, obtained a passing grade on the exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE: Non-Competitive

Chad Swearington to the position of Surveyor in the Department of Water. This position was posted as a non-competitive exam. The staff provided evidence to support the rules for the non-competitive appointment of this item as the candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possesses the specific skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the

department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Laura Fangman to the position of Public Health Nurse 2 in the Finance Department. This position was posted as a non-competitive exam. The staff provided evidence to support the rules for the non-competitive appointment of this item as the candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possesses the specific skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Philip Partridge to the position of Zoning Plan Examiner (Building Plans Interim) in the Planning and Buildings Department. This position was posted as a non-competitive exam. The staff provided evidence to support the rules for the non-competitive appointment of this item as the candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, is registered by the State of Ohio in his field, possesses the specific skills needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Dr. Sheeba Ayli to the position of Public Health Pediatrician in the Health Department. This position was posted as a non-competitive exam. The staff provided evidence to support the rules for the non-competitive appointment of this item as the candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, is registered with the State Medical Board of Ohio, possesses the specific skills needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Michael Forrester to the position of Senior Environmental/Safety Specialist (City Energy Manager) in the City Manager's Office/Office of Environment and Sustainability. The staff provided evidence to support the rules for the non-competitive appointment of this item as the candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possesses the specific skills needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Promotion

Traci Gibson to the position of Motor Equipment Operator 1 in the Department of Water. This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting and was selected, within the collective bargaining agreement, from among the passing candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

Sonny Bauer to the position of Supervisor of Maintenance in the Department of Water. This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting and was selected, within the collective bargaining agreement, from among the passing candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Promotion Without Exam

Randall Schneider to the position of Senior Engineer in the Department of Sewers. The candidate currently holds the position of Engineer Intern, met the minimum requirements, and has received a Senior Engineer certification from the State of Ohio. Based on the professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Sarah Perrino to the position of Senior Engineer in the Department of Transportation and Engineering. The candidate currently holds the position of Engineer Intern, met the minimum requirements, and has received a Senior Engineer certification from the State of Ohio. Based on the professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

Barbara Wiley Kroner to the position of Nursing Supervisor in the Health Department. Pursuant to Civil Service Rule 10§9 (C), a promotional examination was not administered. The candidate met the minimum requirements and the needs of the department, was interviewed and selected from among the three qualified and interested employees who applied for the position of Nursing Supervisor. Based on the professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Transfer/Re-assignment

Rochelle Thompson to the Position of Employment and Training Supervisor in the Department of Sewers. Ms. Thompson previously appeared at the November 20, 2014 Commission meeting with her attorney, Ms. Carrie Barron to express her perspective of the re-assignment to the position of Supervising Human Resources Analyst in the Human Resources Department. Ms. Thompson again appeared at the January 8, 2015 meeting. The City was represented by Ms. Julie Bissinger, Senior Assistant City Solicitor with the City's Law Department. Ms. Bissinger advised the Commission that there was an opportunity for re-assignment to the position of Employment and Training Supervisor at the Department of Sewers available to Ms. Thompson. Ms. Thompson announced her acceptance of re-assignment. The Commission noted this item.

John Ridder to the position of Senior Accountant in the Finance Department. The Finance Department provided notice of the transfer of the candidate to the position of Senior Accountant within the Finance Department. He was selected from among the candidates referred to the department from due to his extensive experience and background and the specific skills needed by the department. The Commission noted this item.

Austin Lubbers to the position of Senior Accountant in the Finance Department. The Finance Department provided notice of the transfer of the candidate to the position of Senior Accountant within the Finance Department. He was selected from among the candidates referred to the department due to his exceptional qualifications and the specific skills needed by the department. The Commission noted this item.

ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Temporary Appointment

Saakhi Grover to the temporary position of Human Resources Analyst in the Human Resources Department. The Human Resources department requested approval for the temporary appointment of the candidate to the position of Human Resources Analyst as there is an urgent need to fill the vacancy in order to provide continuity in service until the position can be filled permanently. The Commission approved this item.

ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request for Approval of Exam Schedules/Exam Review Sessions Materials

- a. Senior Customer Relations Representative
- b. Water Works Maintenance Field Supervisor Structured Oral Board Interviews (January 5-10, 2015)
- c. Truck Driver (Test Material for Exam Review Session)

The Commission approved these items.

ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request for Approval of Special Examiners

- a. Michael Cervay, Douglas Robinson and Bobbi Hageman for the Buyer and Senior Buyer exams
- b. Rick St. John, Tim Williams and Terry Fox for the Wastewater Collection Inspector (SMU) exam

The Commission approved these items.

ELIGIBLE LISTS: Request for Approval

- a) Crime Analyst (Training & Experience) – Open Competitive
- b) Operator and Dispatcher (Lateral Open)

The Commission approved these items.

CLASSIFICATION: Request for the approval of new and/or revised classification specifications:

- a) Buyer
- b) Electrical Maintenance Worker 2 (item withdrawn)
- c) Fire Recruit/Firefighter
- d) Executive Project Director (Economic Inclusion) – UNCLASSIFIED
- e) Employment and Training Supervisor

The Commission approved these items.

CLASSIFICATION: Request from Departments to add/delete positions to their table of organization:

- a. **Health Department:** Add (1) Dental Assistant and delete (1) Customer Relations Representative
- b. **Department of Water:** Add (1) Accounting Technician 3 and delete (1) Administrative Technician
- c. **Department of Public Services:** Add (2) Sanitation Specialist and delete (2) Sanitation Helper
- d. **Department of Public Services:** Add (1) Supervising Architect
- e. **City Manager's Office/Office of Environment and Sustainability:** Add (1) Senior Environmental/Safety Specialist (City Energy Manager)

The Commission approved these items.

APPEAL TO THE COMMISSION: Information Items:

a) Appeal Hearing Schedule:

| Name | Scheduled for: |
|-----------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| David Johnson | Scheduled for January 29, 2015 |
| Richard Johnson | Coordinating Hearing Meeting Date |
| Phillip Jones | Continuance Requested to seek Representation |
| Robert DeBonis | Appellant awaiting delivery of Subpoenaed documents/ Scheduling Suspended |
| Daryl Ross | On Hold/Law Dept. to provide on-going updates |

The staff provided information on the current Appeal Hearing Schedule. The Commission noted this item and requested follow-up regarding the hearing schedule.

APPLICATION FOR ENTRANCE EXAM:

Request from Antoinette Nicole Hanson for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit Physical Ability Test. The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Ashley Ward for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit Physical Ability Test. The candidate was present at the meeting to present additional information relating to the request. Mr. Darrell Ludlow, Senior Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department, was also present. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Candace Mason for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit Physical Ability Test. The candidate was present at the meeting to present additional information relating to the request. Mr. Darrell Ludlow, Senior Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department, was also present. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Daniel Shaffer for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit Physical Ability Test. The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Kevin Doherty for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit Physical Ability Test. The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Kimberly Koehler for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit Physical Ability Test. The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Lamont Barber for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit Physical Ability Test. The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Lucas Thorneycroft for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit Physical Ability Test. The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Charles Wright to appeal the rejection of his application for the Police Officer-Lateral Entry (Open) Exam. The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Joseph Grady to appeal the rejection of his application for the Police Officer-Lateral Entry (Open) Exam. The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Justin Blanton to appeal the rejection of his application for the Police Officer-Lateral Entry (Open) Exam. The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Mark Albrechtsen to appeal the rejection of his application for the Police Officer-Lateral Entry (Open) Exam. The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Michael Long to appeal the rejection of his application for the Police Officer-Lateral Entry (Open) Exam. The candidate was present at the meeting to present additional information relating to the request. Mr. Darrell Ludlow, Senior Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department, was also present. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Michael Lowe to appeal the rejection of his application for the Police Officer-Lateral Entry (Open) Exam. The candidate was present at the meeting accompanied by Mr. Terrance Forte, Police Officer with the City of Cincinnati, who spoke as a character witness on behalf of the candidate. Mr. Darrell Ludlow, Senior Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department, was also present and responded to questions/inquires posed by the Commissioners. Mr. Lowe provided information regarding his former employer abruptly disbanding the police department due to funding issues. The Commission, after considering the information presented, approved the request based on the unique circumstances of this particular situation.

Request from William Gaffney to appeal the rejection of his application for the Police Officer-Lateral Entry (Open) Exam. The candidate was present at the meeting to present additional information relating to the request. Mr. Darrell Ludlow, Senior Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department, was also present. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Orlando Byrden to appeal the rejection of his application for the Electrical Maintenance Helper position. The candidate was present at the meeting to speak on the matter of his application rejection and offered information relating to his background and qualification. Mr. Byrden stated that his educational background and practical experience, though not explicitly stated on the classification, met the qualifications. Mr. Bruce Ross, Human Resources Analyst with the Human Resources Department was also present. The Commission denied the request.

Request from Scott McCollum to appeal the rejection of his application for the Electrical Maintenance Helper position. The candidate was present at the meeting to speak on the matter of his application rejection and offered information relating to his background and qualification. Mr. McCollum stated that his educational background and practical experience, though not explicitly stated on the classification, met the qualifications. Mr. Bruce Ross, Human Resources Analyst with the Human Resources Department was also present. The Commission denied the request.

ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request to Speak Before Commission

Request from Joshua Re to speak before the Commission regarding the Police Recruit Physical Ability Test. The candidate was present at the meeting to justify the opportunity for being allowed to re-take Police Recruit Physical Ability Test. Mr. Darrell Ludlow, Senior Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department was also present. The Commission heard his comments and noted his concerns.

Request from Samantha Parrigan to speak before the Commission regarding the Police Recruit Physical Ability Test. The candidate was present at the meeting to justify the opportunity for being allowed to re-take Police Recruit Physical Ability Test. Mr. Darrell Ludlow, Senior Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department was also present. The Commission heard her comments and noted her concerns.

Request from Tonya Terrell to speak before the Commission regarding the Police Recruit Physical Ability Test. The candidate was present at the meeting to justify the opportunity for being allowed to re-take Police Recruit Physical Ability Test. Mr. Darrell Ludlow, Senior Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department was also present. The Commission heard her comments and noted her concerns.

Request from Trenton Hastings to speak before the Commission regarding the Police Recruit Physical Ability Test. The candidate was present at the meeting to justify the opportunity for being allowed to re-take Police Recruit Physical Ability Test. Mr. Darrell Ludlow, Senior Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department was also present. The Commission heard his comments and noted his concerns.

Request from Marcus Potter to speak before the Commission regarding the Service Area Coordinator position. Mr. Potter was present at the meeting to speak about his concerns regarding how appointments from the Service Area Coordinator eligible list were processed and advised the Commission that he was skipped over for a chance to promote to the position of Service Area Coordinator. The Commission heard his comments and noted his concerns.

Request from John Sanders to speak before the Commission regarding the Senior Sanitarian position. Mr. Sanders was present to speak on the situation surrounding a promotion to Senior Sanitarian. He was accompanied by his supervisor, Ms. Gail Long-Cook, who reinforced Mr. Sanders' sentiments, and expressed the urgent needs of the Health Department to provide service to its growing customer base around the City. Ms. Alexandria White, Senior Human Resources Analyst was also present. The Commission heard his concerns and took this item under advisement for further consideration.

JANUARY 8, 2015

MINUTES cont'd...

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION:

Update regarding City of Cincinnati/Department of Justice's review of the 2012 Police Recruit Process. The Commission noted the information.

The legal representatives of the Cincinnati Organization of Dedicated Employees (CODE) Bargaining Unit have requested to address each item on the agenda per Civil Service Rule 2, Section 5. CODE representatives were not present at the meeting. The Commission noted all items as waived.